

‘Stones vs. Lives: Proportionality and Non-Human Value’

American University of Beirut

19 – 20 November, 2018

Monday 19th November

09.30 – 09.45 Welcome and Introduction

09.45 – 11.00 Helen Frowe (Philosophy, Stockholm University) and Derek Matravers
(Open University)

11.00 – 11.30 Coffee

11.30 – 12.45 Frederik Rosen (Nordic Center for Cultural Heritage and Armed Conflict)
‘Between a Rock and the Soul: The Moral Riddle of Cultural Property In War’

12.45 – 14.00 Lunch

14.00 – 15.15 Bashshar Haydar (AUB)
‘Cultural Heritage in War: A Moral Taxonomy’

15.15 – 15.45 Coffee

15.45 – 17.00 Amr Al-Azm (Shawnee State University)
‘The Role of Non-State Actors in Preserving Cultural Heritage in times of Conflict:
Syria as a case study’

Tuesday 20th November

09.30 – 10.45 Maamoun Abdulkarim (University of Damascus)
‘Destruction and Reconstruction of the Syrian heritage during the crisis’

10.45 – 11.15 Coffee

11.15 – 12.30 Massimo Renzo (King’s College, London)
‘Repatriation and Compensation in the Aftermath of War’



12.30 – 13.45 Lunch

13.45 – 15.00 Cristina Menegazzi (UNESCO)

‘The Role of UNESCO for the Preservation of Syrian Cultural Heritage’

15.00 – 15.30 Coffee

15.45 – 17.00 Gerald Lang (Leeds University)

‘Defence and Escalation’

Abstracts

‘Reconstruction and the ‘Cultural Turn’ in Heritage’

Derek Matravers and Helen Frowe

This paper considers the implications the ‘cultural turn’, within the world of those concerned with heritage, has for the future of heritage damaged and destroyed in war. It argues that identifying ‘the stakeholders’, that is, those whose opinions should be canvassed, does not merely identify who should answer the question as to the fate of damaged or destroyed heritage, but also points some way to an answer to that question. This is because the issue is, in part, that of compensating for an injustice done to those stakeholders. However, the question of the right way to compensate for such an injustice leaves open a variety of options both because there are a variety of forms such compensation could take, and the facts constrain what compensation is available.

‘Between a Rock and The Soul: The Moral Riddle of Cultural Property in War’

Frederik Rosén

(Nordic Center for Cultural Heritage and Armed Conflict, Denmark)

For at least 100 years, cultural property has become a progressively significant issue during armed conflicts. The development has been accompanied by a concurrent growth in international norms, laws and state practice recognizing the intrinsic value of cultural property. Yet the family of academic conversations forming the field of just war theory for some reasons only very recently started to take an interest in the ethics of cultural property destruction and protection. This article contribute to these nascent discussions. It suggest some explanations for why the interest from just war theory lags behind before identifying a number of general difficulties for it to embrace cultural property as an object of Just War Theory.

‘Cultural Heritage in War: A Moral Taxonomy’

Bashshar Haydar (American University of Beirut)

The paper distinguishes various types situations in which cultural heritage may be implicated in war. It tries to identify the moral question, posed by each of these situations, about justifiability of military action, liability, and proportionately. In particular, the papers focus on possible grounds for military action that aims at the protection of cultural heritage, and argue that each



of these grounds has different implications on the determining the proportionality question as well as the principle of precaution.

'The Role of Non-State Actors in Preserving Cultural Heritage in times of Conflict: Syria as a case study'

Amr Al-Azm (Shawnee State University)

The greatest burden to protect Syria's cultural heritage during this conflict has fallen on local stakeholders and non-state actors, including local councils and NGOs. The majority of these non-state actors are centred on networks of local heritage professionals and civil society activists. These local networks are working in desperate conditions to protect museums and cultural heritage sites, often finding creative and simple solutions to overcome these daunting challenges whilst trying to preserve Syria's cultural heritage. They are also at the forefront in promoting awareness and strengthening local communities' sense of ownership of their cultural heritage, in order to mobilize them against looters and trade in artefacts. Yet because they are non-state actors, they are often denied any financial or technical support from international organisations and donors who traditionally deal only with member states and their institutions.

As stakeholders, local communities can play a very important role in protecting cultural heritage, and be an integral part of the preparedness on the ground for emergency protection procedures when sites are under immediate threat. However, given the appalling carnage and unprecedented levels of human suffering sweeping the country, there is the danger of an emerging binary that you either care about ancient stones, monuments and artefacts or you care about current humanitarian issues and the people affected. Despite that danger, heritage professionals and everyday people on both sides of the divide have rejected this binary by recognizing that culture and people are inextricably linked with a role to play in post conflict stabilization and reconciliation.

'Destruction and Reconstruction of the Syrian Heritage during the Crises'

Maamoun Abdulkarim (University of Damascus)

The Syrian cultural heritage is characterized by richness and diversity through the presence of more than ten thousand archaeological sites throughout the Syrian territories and dates back to different time periods from prehistoric times until the end of Islamic times. Hundreds of thousand artifacts have been discovered through archaeological excavations that have been conducted in various missions of different nationalities for more than a century.

This heritage is exposed to sabotage and theft because of the conditions experienced by Syria during the crisis, where a number of historic cities such as Aleppo and Homs have become battlefields, a large part of the cultural heritage has been destroyed, and archaeological gangs have excavated in a large number of archaeological sites, From regional groups organized in the theft of antiquities. Al-Da'ash terrorists groups also has ideological goals to destroyed of many archaeological buildings such as the city of Palmyra.

Because of these challenges and risks that threatened the Syrian heritage since 2011 to 2017, we have undertaken a series of precautionary measures to save the archaeological treasures in Syrian museums, thus saving the absolute majority of the artifacts and we transfer its to the city of Damascus and packaging and documented its, and then hide in safe places. We also launched an awareness campaign among the members of the local community in the entire Syrian territory in order to unify the vision of the Syrians to defend their threatened heritage away from differences in political visions.

After seven years of war, the Syrian heritage faces new challenges of how to restore it and find international financial and technical support, especially as natural and human factors negatively affect this heritage over time.

'Repatriation and Compensation in the Aftermath of War'



Massimo Renzo (King's College, London)

In war, cultural artefacts and works of art are often destroyed or looted. When this happens, a duty to return these items or pay compensation for their destruction is triggered. However, what happens when the artefacts and works of art in question had been previously acquired through unjust means? Who is owed compensation in this case? And to whom should these items be returned?"

'The Role of UNESCO for the Preservation of Syrian Cultural Heritage'
Cristina Menegazzi (UNESCO)

UNESCO has been active in preserving the Syrian cultural heritage since the beginning of the crisis.

In particular, it launched in March 2014, the dedicated project "Emergency Safeguarding of the Syrian Cultural Heritage". The main project goal is to mitigate the on-going loss of cultural heritage in Syria and pave the way for post-conflict priority actions, and medium and long-term actions, following the considerable damage to, and loss of, cultural heritage since March 2011, with the overall objective of contributing to restore social cohesion, stability and sustainable development in Syria. UNESCO has applied a three-pronged approach to monitor and assess the cultural heritage (tangible: built and movable; and intangible) situation in Syria through updated and continued knowledge and documentation; mitigate the destruction and loss of Syrian cultural heritage through national and international communication and awareness-raising efforts; and protect and safeguard Syrian cultural heritage through enhanced technical assistance and capacity-building for national stakeholders and beneficiaries.

'Defence and Escalation'
Gerald Lang (Leeds University)

Should we save monuments or people? Surely, given that stark choice, we have to save people. But those who illegitimately threaten monuments can still be threatened with violence, and those threats can still be enacted. In this paper I try to explain why, drawing on the escalatory structure of defensive justifications.